| **Student Name:** Ivy Xu |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house regrets the increasing commercialisation of 'self care' |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Is this a debate about the beauty industry, or about mindfulness? Read the info-slide! I also think if the opening is aiming at a claim on exploitation, you should make this as clear as possible.  Set-up   * We need to explain what this commercialisation looks like! How has it been commercialised, who does it, how? * Good work making sure there is a counterfactual; what would have happened to self care instead? Fair on how commercialisation means there is a specific interpretation and imposition of this interpretation of it. * How would people access it in the CF? What was this like before commercialisation happened? POI from Matias should also point this out; yoga always existed - now big companies try to be the sole proprietor of this.   Your set-up HAS to be more efficient; even if this was a 6 minute speech, you’d already have spent half your speech on this.  Argument 1   * Who are these individuals? Good on young girls being the vulnerable ones in this instance. Discuss how commercialisation means that you target individual insecurities and anxieties; discuss how they’re told the ONLY way to get better is through these means and mechanisms. * What impact does this have? Discuss how it leads to consumerism - and how social media compounds this further. * Your claim is intuitive, but you aren’t spending time explaining how exactly these insecurities take root and develop and fester etc.   05:17 - time management!  Ask POIs consistently!  I think we should analyse what the value of self-care is, what a world without commercialisation looks like; how people would have a higher quality of access, and why awareness would exist anyways. Discuss how big corporations or companies take things like yoga away from local communities and ethnic groups - whitewash them and make them aesthetic. | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Stephanie Kwan |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house regrets the increasing commercialisation of 'self care' |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  How for the better? If it is about awareness and this critical takeaway that caring for yourself matters - make this the opening straight away.  Fair on stigma - explain how commercialisation BROKE the stigma and made this more accessible; remember that this is a retrospective debate. How and why did this change occur? You need to walk me through what the status quo used to be, how commercialisation occurred, and then these changes. You can use this to respond to Yeonseo’s POI - that when we started discussing it, is when it became normalised. I think you should also call out Prop for making this debate about beauty near exclusively, as opposed to therapy and mindfulness.  Explain why the very specific interpretation of self-care doesn’t go unchallenged! Is there a monopoly on what self care must be?  Why has the quality of care improved? Assertion, never explained? Commercialisation - proliferation - hence lower, because more companies join in in offering this service; good snowball effect analysis.  Why or how does working culture change? How do the incentives of companies or workers change - and in what way?  What is the structure of this speech? You have to signpost! This is just analysis throughout, with no clear strategic direction. Remember - you have to give me a hook, offer very clear signposting, rebuttal - and then explain what your argument is.  05:07 - Don’t take more than two POIs! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Yeonseo Kim |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house regrets the increasing commercialisation of 'self care' |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Great flow up top. I think we want to start by explicitly saying we’ll clarify what this debate is about; about who commercialises self-care, and why awareness does not equal commercialisation. Rather - it is awareness that came BEFORE self-care; if it was stigmatised, would big corporations even have invested into this in the first place?  Good call out on argument quality - explain implication; that they never achieve this impact and that the judge cannot credit them for it.  On market equilibrium - I think the Opp argument is being misunderstood; that when supply increases, price has to go down due to the multiplicity of options. We need to say that the very specific interpretation of what commercialisation looks like means that it remains inaccessible. It isn’t about well priced therapy, but buying your lululemon to be able to go to therapy. Bring back the characterisation work Ivy does in her first speech. Explain HOW commercialization transforms these practices into commodities accessible only to those who can afford them.  On the imposition - I see how this ties into Ivy’s characterisation, but this ends up not evolving past the material she’s already presented. The material right at the end on mental health - and the way in which consumption occurs, and ends up hurting yourself + your bank account is good. Make this the thrust of the argument instead.  05:58 - good!  I think we should analyse what the value of self-care is, what a world without commercialisation looks like; how people would have a higher quality of access, and why awareness would exist anyways. Discuss how big corporations or companies take things like yoga away from local communities and ethnic groups - whitewash them and make them aesthetic. | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Hanson Ko |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house regrets the increasing commercialisation of 'self care' |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 67.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Our opening is a criticism of their case - I want you to start with a rebuttal instead. If they run a negative case - does this mean they automatically lose?  Rebuttals  Unaffordable; why is yoga or meditation accessible? Explain HOW commercialisation led to this in the first place. Don’t skim past it - explain how commercialisation meant that lots of content creators started to make tutorials on youtube, or companies invested in making this available, and due to supply increasing + need to attract customers - reduced prices.  Why do workaholics change? Why do their incentive structures change, how and when?  On the concession - explain why there are checking mechanisms; how does call out culture or refusal to pay for bad services not apply?  Extension  Fair on stigma - explain how commercialisation BROKE the stigma and made this more accessible; remember that this is a retrospective debate. How and why did this change occur? You need to walk me through what the status quo used to be, how commercialisation occurred, and then these changes. I think you should also call out Prop for making this debate about beauty near exclusively, as opposed to therapy and mindfulness.  You’re speaking too fast and eating words as a result; slow down where you want me to takeaway something very specifically and carefully.  Good work marking your transitions - makes your speech very easy to track.  04:50 - I think we need to reiterate that mental health is what this debate is about - and how our side made self-care in this regard more accessible, cheaper - and Prop never had any response to this. | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Annabel Cheung |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house regrets the increasing commercialisation of 'self care' |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Good call out - explain what the difference is; good on how commercialisation takes off. Point out how the cycle continues - does buying a yoga mat make you FEEL better, does it solve the root cause? Point out how this then leads to people having to self-care harder, and so the consumerism masquerading as a practice develops further. We do this later on, but it can be done in one go up top.  POI - good response; point out how it is awareness that came BEFORE commercialisation; if it was stigmatised, would big corporations even have invested into this in the first place?  What is the structure of this speech? Please please please make sure that as a third speaker you are using clashes. You have great analysis, but it lacks any structure and clear strategic direction.  POI - is this true? You can talk about how globalisation and the internet lead to this - THEN big corporations capitalised on this and stole it away from ethnic influencers - link this to appropriation and white-washing.  On market equilibrium - I think the Opp argument is being misunderstood; that when supply increases, price has to go down due to the multiplicity of options. We need to say that the very specific interpretation of what commercialisation looks like means that it remains inaccessible. It isn’t about well priced therapy, but buying your lululemon to be able to go to therapy. Bring back the characterisation work Ivy does in her first speech. Explain HOW commercialization transforms these practices into commodities accessible only to those who can afford them.  What is genuine self-care? How does your side ensure it occurs? What is the positive defence of the counterfactual?  You need to introduce more variance in your flow - it sounds like you’re reading even where you very clearly aren’t.  05:07  I think we should analyse what the value of self-care is, what a world without commercialisation looks like; how people would have a higher quality of access, and why awareness would exist anyways. Discuss how big corporations or companies take things like yoga away from local communities and ethnic groups - whitewash them and make them aesthetic. | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Matias Li |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house regrets the increasing commercialisation of 'self care' |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Explain HOW or WHY mental health awareness came about exclusively due to commercialisation; or even if awareness existed before, accessibility didn’t. How did therapy become cheaper? Where did apps for counselling come about? You do well to pinpoint that this isn’t just about beauty, but we need to explain WHY! Is this just a debate about the beauty industry, which perpetuates this anyways due to profit incentive, or is this about self care - which is fundamentally different?  POI: explain how affordability comes through commercialisation - you’re right on range of pricing, but aren’t explaining why commercialisation CAUSES this. Explain HOW commercialisation led to this in the first place. Don’t skim past it - explain how commercialisation meant that lots of content creators started to make tutorials on youtube, or companies invested in making this available, and due to supply increasing + need to attract customers - reduced prices.  Fair on how overconsumption is normal, but Prop spends a lot time explaining how exploitative this is - you need to explain why or how you deal with exploitation.  Why are we going speaker by speaker? At PSD III, we cannot not use clashes!  Explain how commercialisation BROKE the stigma and made this more accessible; remember that this is a retrospective debate. How and why did this change occur? You need to walk me through what the status quo used to be, how commercialisation occurred, and then these changes. I think you should also call out Prop for making this debate about beauty near exclusively, as opposed to therapy and mindfulness.  05:07 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Peyton Qian |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house regrets the increasing commercialisation of 'self care' |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Clear opening, good work jumping straight to clashes.  Clash 1  Good on commercialisation being the tipping point towards access and awareness. Explain why this is true; how did this occur? Explain HOW or WHY mental health awareness came about exclusively due to commercialisation; or even if awareness existed before, accessibility didn’t.  How did therapy become cheaper? Where did apps for counselling come about? You do well to pinpoint that this isn’t just about beauty, but we need to explain WHY! Is this just a debate about the beauty industry, which perpetuates this anyways due to profit incentive, or is this about self care - which is fundamentally different?  Clash 2  What is this mental health research?  Explain how commercialisation BROKE the stigma and made this more accessible; remember that this is a retrospective debate. How and why did this change occur? You need to walk me through what the status quo used to be, how commercialisation occurred, and then these changes. Step by step analysis of how commercialization leads to access is needed!  I think it’s a jump to say that workaholics or working culture changes radically; there’s no real explanation as to why people currently overwork, why their habits change and in what capacity, and what implication this has. Why will the HR department at a workplace give you more days off or encourage you to behave in this way? I think we should instead discuss how these conversations became normalised, and getting help became actively cheaper, even if people were already aware it was a problem in the first place.  04:55  We need to ask POIs consistently! | | | | | | |